



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

VII.—SOPHOCLES PHILOCTETES 1360-61.

The context shows that Philoctetes is thinking of the probability, if not certainty, that Odysseus and the Atreidae will continue to be *κακοί* in Troy as they were *κακοί* in Lemnos when they abandoned him on the desert island (1356). Any attempt to restore the text without keeping this fact constantly in view must result in failure. At the end of his entreaty (1369 f.) the sufferer repeats the thought: *ἔα κακῶς αὐτοὺς ἀπόλλυσθαι κακοὺς . . . κοῦ κακοὺς ἐπωφελῶν δόξεις ὁμοῖος τοῖς κακοῖς πεφυκέναι*.

The passage has been variously *mis*-understood. Hermann's interpretation of the text is impossible. The other three explanations (1. Brunck and Buttmann, 2. Musgrave, 3. Schneidewin) are, to say the least, extremely improbable. Of the numerous emendations, Wakefield's is the only one that alters *παιδεύει*. Jebb, Reiske, Seyffert, Meineke, Dobree, Erfurdt, and others, change some other word, or words.

My conviction is that the seat of the corruption is in *παιδεύει*. The patent meaning of the verse is: *ἐὰν γνώμη κακῶν μήτηρ γένηται, τᾶλλα γ' ἂ τίκτει κακὰ (ἔσται)*. The context alone proves this. Consequently, what we want is some verb like *τίκτει*, *φιτύει*, *φέρει*, to replace *παιδεύει*. But, since Sophocles does not always continue the metaphor to the very end of the thought (and here *μήτηρ γένηται* is merely a poetical expression for *ἄπαξ φρονῆ*), the lost verb is probably one that corresponds to our 'meditate,' 'cogitate.' I suggest *εἰλύει* (*uoluit*). The scribe that unwittingly wrought the change misread ΓΕΙΑΥΕΙ as ΠΑΙΔΕΥΕΙ (Π for Γ and Δ for Λ, as often). In fact, this very word was converted into *εἰδύει* by some copyist: "eodemque modo ab eod. vitiose scriptum εἰδύει" (*Thesaurus*, s. v.).

The Homeric verb *εἰλύειν* is not used by any other tragic poet, and by Sophocles only in the *Philoctetes*, where it occurs three times. This rare word would naturally cause some mistake in copying; and the not dissimilar *παιδεύει* seemed to be a fitting word after *μήτηρ γένηται*. In early times there were doubtless other manuscripts which preserved the true reading. A comparison of these MSS would tend to show that the general sense

of the passage was 'when one's mind brings forth bad children, they are generally brought up bad.' Hence one meaning given to ειλύνει would be ἐκτρέφειν. Curiously enough, this is just what has happened, for one signification assigned to ειλύνω by the lexicographers is ἐκτρέφω, on which the writer in the Thesaurus remarks: "sed habet praeterea . . . et κτυπεῖ, item ἐκτρέφει. At quid de his exp. tam diversis a praecedente sentiendum est? . . . Praesertim tamen de duabus exp. id a me dictum intelligi volo, sc. κτυπεῖ et ἐκτρέφει."

The metaphor in ειλύνει is common to all languages, and even if no exact parallel could be found in Greek, we would be justified in substituting this verb for παιδεύει in the passage under discussion, for ρειλύνω is *uoluo*, and ειλύνει means 'revolves,' 'turns over,' 'invents,' 'meditates,' 'cogitates,' 'conceives.' Indeed, Cicero's characterization of Catiline might be applied to Odysseus by Philoctetes: "quid enim mali aut sceleris fingi aut excogitari potest, quod non ille conceperit?" (*Cat.* 2. 4. 2). Examples of *uoluer* (or *uolutare*) in this sense are numerous (Sallust, Tacitus). So in Italian *volgere* means 'aggirarsi in mente' or 'nell' animo' (= *meditare*). So in French 'rouler en la tête' (Molière, *L'Étourdi* 3. 1), or 'dans l'esprit.' The Spanish *volver* is used in the same way. But we do not have to go to other languages for parallels: the ordinary Greek word στρέφειν has a similar metaphorical use. Cp. Eur. *Hec.* 750 τί στρέφω τάδε; Plato, *Phaedr.* 278 D ἄνω κάτω στρέφον (the Chaucerian 'rollid up and down'), Dion. Hal. 6. 867. 10, Arrian, *Epict.* 4. 6. 15 ἄνω κάτω στρέφω τοὺς προτεινομένους λόγους, 3. 21 καθήμενος αὐτὰ στρέφε αὐτὸς ἐπὶ σαντοῦ, Luc. *Alex.* 8, *De Merc. Cond.* 17, *Dial. Mer.* 10. 2. Consequently, I am inclined to think that Sophocles wrote οἷς γὰρ ἡ γνώμη κακῶν | μήτηρ γένηται, πᾶλλα γ' ειλύνει κακά, and that the thought is the same (though the metaphor is slightly different) as in Aesch. *Prom.* 888 ἐν γνώμῃ ἐβάστασε. Cp. Ar. *Thesm.* 438 πάσας δ' ἰδέας ἐξήτασεν, | πάντα δ' ἐβάστασεν φρενί.

A word remains to be said on the connotation of ειλύνει in the other two passages of the play in which the verb occurs. Jebb translates ειλύομην (291) 'crawl' and compares Plato, *Tim.* 92 ἰλυσπώμενα ἐπὶ γῆς (the participle here has nothing to do with ειλύνειν) and adds: "Thus the notion is different from that of ειλίποδες (βοῦς), where a 'rolling' gait is meant." In my opin-

ion, it is just this rolling, 'wibbly-wabbly,' tottering gait that the poet has in mind: the limping Philoctetes goes *clopin-clopant*, but he goes also *à cloche-pied* (which in popular etymology at least would be associated with *cloche*, 'a bell'). The sufferer toddles along with uncertain steps like a child *ἄπερ φίλας τιθήνας* (703). If *εἰλυόμενος* means 'creeping' in 702, then *εἶρπε* in 701 is otiose. Moreover, both *πταίων* and *τό τοι σύνηθες ὀρθώσει μ' ἔθος* in 894 indicate that the lame man is making full use of his sound leg (as he naturally would), not placing the knee of this leg against the ground. A man with two sound legs sways slightly from side to side as he moves forward; but in the case of a *boiteux* this swaying motion is much more marked: one who walks *à cloche-pied* describes small circles (*uoluitur, εἰλύεται*); the forward movement is spiral, since both feet are not planted equally firmly on the ground. Cp. Molière, *Scap.* 2. 1 "ce vers cloche," that is, "n'est pas sur ses pieds." Even as I write these words I observe from my window a French ex-soldier whose left leg is so maimed that it can almost be said to dangle from the trunk: the nutations of his torso and the oscillations of his legs are just such as I imagine Philoctetes to have made as he *εἰλύετο* dragging after him his *δύστηνον πόδα*. The stick on which he leans is but a poor substitute for a sound leg.

Even in the passages in which *εἰλύω* means *oculto*, the primary meaning of the word appears, for the idea is generally 'envelop' (*inuoluo, obuoluo*).

J. E. HARRY.